



Office of the Secretary of Defense  
Reserve Forces Policy Board  
*Quarterly Meeting*



Minutes – Tuesday, November 29, 2011  
Pentagon Conference Center, Room B-6

**MEETING ATTENDEES**

(Official Federal Advisory Committee Act Sign-In Sheets Attached)

**Members Present:**

1. MajGen Arnold L. Punaro, USMCR, Retired - Chairman
2. VADM John G. Cotton, USNR, Retired
3. RADM Steven E. Day, USCGR
4. Maj Gen H. Michael Edwards, ANG
5. Maj Gen Anita R. Gallentine, USAFR
6. Gen John W. Handy, USAF, Retired
7. BGen James M. Lariviere, USMCR
8. The Hon. Grier Martin - Member, North Carolina House of Representatives
9. Ms. Paulette M. Mason – Delaware Chair, Employer Support of the Guard and Reserve
10. Mr. Sergio A. Pecori – President & Chief Executive Officer of Hanson Professional Services Inc.
11. Maj Gen James N. Stewart, USAFR - Military Executive of the Board (non-voting)
12. MG Jeffrey W. Talley, USAR
13. The Hon. Gary E. (Gene) Taylor - Former Congressman of Mississippi
14. MG R. Martin Umbarger, ARNG
15. Ms. Maria J. Vorel – Disaster Operations Coordinator, Federal Insurance & Mitigation Administration, Federal Emergency Management Agency

**Invited Guests:**

1. MajGen Darrell L. Moore, USMCR, Director Reserve Affairs
2. Maj Gen Kelly M. McKeague, ANG, CJCS for National Guard Matters
3. COL Steven Knott, USAR, ARFPC Military Executive
4. COL Debra Sinnott, USAR, Director Strategy & Intelligence, OCAR
5. Col Gib O'Very, Jr., USMCR, Office of Marine Forces Reserve
6. CAPT Dwayne Baxter, USN, OCNR
7. CAPT Jon Kreitz, USN, Office of the Chief Navy Reserve
8. Major Silas Darden, USAR
9. Ms. Annette Hamm-Brown, Office of the Secretary of Defense, Human Resources
10. Ms. Eboni Myart, OSD Photographer

**Briefers:**

1. RADM Steven E. Day, USCGR (substitute for Rear Admiral David Callahan due to illness)
2. VADM Dirk J. Debbink, USNR, Chief of Navy Reserve
3. LtGen Steven A. Hummer, USMCR, Commander Marine Forces Reserve
4. MG Timothy J. Kadavy, ARNG, Deputy Director Army National Guard
5. Lt Gen Charles E. Stenner, Jr., USAFR, Chief Air Force Reserve
6. MG Keith L. Thurgood, USAR,
7. Lt Gen Harry M. Wyatt III, ANG, Director, Air National Guard
8. General Craig McKinley, ANG, Chief National Guard Bureau

**RFPB Staff:**

1. Col Michelle Obata, USAFR
2. COL Roger Lintz, USAR
3. COL Robert Priess, ARNG
4. Col Mary Salcido, ANG
5. Col Dona Iversen, USAFR
6. CDR Steve Knight, USN
7. LtCol Kenneth Olivo, USMC (DFO)
8. LTJG Stephen Cheng, USCGR
9. CWO4 George Rubesha, USCGR
10. SGM Gary L. Martz, USAR
11. SMSgt Joyce Voyles, USAFR
12. Mr. Paul Briggs
13. CDR Kerstin Rhinehart, USCGR
14. MSgt Rosiline Ratliff, USAFR

**OFFICIAL OPENING OF RFPB QUARTERLY MEETING**

RFPB Chairman, MajGen Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) opened the meeting, November 29, 2011 at 0815 and made the following remarks:

- *“The Designated Federal Officer has pre-approved the opening of this meeting, its agenda, and is currently present.”*
- *“Today the Board meets to receive inputs from the Chiefs of each Reserve Component as well as from the Chief of the National Guard Bureau regarding their views on issues of top concern to them. These presentations will provide critically important information to each of our subcommittees as they begin their work of developing recommendations for the Secretary of Defense regarding the Reserve Forces of our Nation.”*

**PRESENTATION OF AWARD**

0830 – 0845. Chairman Punaro introduced LtGen Stenner, USAFR, who then presented the Distinguished Service Medal to Maj Gen James N. Stewart, USAFR. Photographs were taken by Ms. Eboni Myart.

**NEW MEMBERS OATH OF OFFICE**

0845 – 0850. Chairman Punaro introduced Ms. Annette Hamm-Brown, *Executive & Political Personnel, Human Resources Division*, who administered the oath of office to General John W. Handy, USAF (Ret), the newest member of the Board. Photographs were taken by Ms. Eboni Myart.

**GROUP PHOTO**

0850 – 0900. Board members and guest speakers had a group photo taken by Ms. Eboni Myart.

**CHAIRMAN’S REMARKS**

0900. Chairman Punaro welcomed the attendees to the first official meeting of the newly independent RFPB.

- *“The restructured Board is now in a statutory position to go directly to the Secretary of Defense versus through the normal bureaucracy.”*
- The Chairman emphasized that the RFPB’s future focus should concentrate on ensuring that current operational Guard and Reserve capabilities are not lost as we draw down from war and face stark budget realities. Having examined previous draw down of forces since the Korean War, each cut has ranged from 30 to 35% of the force. Currently, the projected cuts during our present draw down appear to be approximately 31%.
- *“In light of these cuts, the RFPB must focus on issues that are relevant and the goal is to become an asset to senior decision makers.”*
- The RFPB will be organized into subcommittees, which will focus on six areas of emphasis:

1. **Insuring a ready, capable, available and sustainable operational reserve.** *“Active duty roles will be reduced over time; therefore, the Guard and Reserve are an indispensable component for the future. Keeping “ready” is imperative since more will be asked of the Guard and Reserve. VADM (ret) Cotton will lead the subcommittee that addresses these issues.”*
2. **Creating a Continuum of Service.** *“How do we create a continuum of service, to include recruitment, retention and reduction of duty statuses? Many experienced and skilled active duty personnel will be leaving the service – some against their will. Offering active duty personnel incentives to retire early (as was done in the mid-90’s) could unintentionally discourage a transition to the Guard and Reserve. DoD needs to retain the experience and provide incentives to enter the Reserve Components. In addition, having the support of employers and family members is a key component to maintaining an operational reserve. Maj Gen Gallentine will lead the subcommittee that addresses these issues.”*
3. **Enhancing DoD’s role in the Homeland.** *“Threats to the Homeland in the form of terrorism and natural disasters continue to increase. How does the Guard and Reserve play a greater role in Homeland defense? Most services do not currently have a requirement for civil support. MG Umbarger will chair the subcommittee that addresses this challenge.”*
4. **Supporting service members, families and employers.** *“The RFPB should support work done helping service members, families and employers in the areas of family support, employer support, compensation, protections, health care, and transition assistance. Ms. Paulette Mason, former Delaware Chair of the ESGR, will chair the subcommittee focusing on these issues.”*
5. **Maximizing the “bang for the buck”.** *“One must take into account how the Guard and Reserve can maximize efficiencies in decision making. It’s important that costs do not increase if recommendations are enacted. There is frustration with the inability of DoD to agree on a cost model for the reserves; this impedes the decision making process. The RFPB must provide an analytical framework and methodology on the costs of the Guard and Reserve, by individual and by unit.”* Chairman Punaro asked the Reserve Component Chiefs to pursue this initiative. *“The end result will be deliberated in open session by the board, voted on, and (if approved) sent forward.”*
6. **Leveraging the Reserve Components’ relationships in local communities.** *“It is important to leverage the local community resources with respect to transition and family support. A task force is currently working on how to best transition personnel back into their communities. The Guard and Reserve Components should partner with the Veterans Administration and the Department of Labor to assist members in this effort. The RFPB should work this issue.”*

#### **RESERVE COMPONENT CHIEFS OPERATIONAL READINESS / TOP ISSUES BRIEFS**

- 0910 – 0940. Chairman Punaro introduced Lt Gen Harry ‘Bud’ Wyatt, from the Air National Guard.
- *“Lt Gen Harry “Bud” Wyatt is the Director of the Air National Guard. Prior to this assignment he served as The Adjutant General of the State of Oklahoma, commanding both Army and Air National Guard troops. He has also served as a U.S. District Court Judge and brings to us a very balanced perspective of citizen service.”*
  - Lt Gen Wyatt began his presentation with a question – *“What keeps me awake at night?”* He answered with a follow up question – *How is the Air Force going to preserve the “Total Force” concept in light of current budget constraints and resource reductions?*
  - His answer - *The Air Force will continue to finance all three components (active Air Force, Air Force Reserve & Air National Guard) in their baseline budget. However, all three components will be getting smaller, but will remain Tier 1 ready.*
  - *The Air National Guard is a cost effective, less expensive force, but no reliable cost model exists which can prove that fact to everyone’s satisfaction (Air Force, DoD, Congress). The Guard and Reserve leadership’s overall opinion is that we are less expensive, but not all agree!*

- Facing past budgetary pressures, AF leadership's tendency has been to shrink back to what is comfortable (preserve as much active force as possible and reduce the reserve components). We should not follow that path this time!
- Greater access to Guard and Reserve personnel is of paramount importance! Lack of access and availability of the reserve components is a common theme heard from senior AF leadership and combatant commanders – we need clear authorities that allow for access. We need DoD and Congressional support to make it easier to access our reserve components.
- Education of DoD leadership on access to reserve components is needed. The Haiti humanitarian operation is an example of leadership not knowing reserve capabilities. In that situation, the Puerto Rican National Guard was ready to support, but leadership thought that the unit needed 30 days notice to go. When an operation is humanitarian, the National Guard doesn't need the lead time. We have experienced volunteers that are ready to respond immediately to crisis situations.
- Deliberate planning by the Services for use of the Guard and Reserves as an operational force is needed. We also need adequate Military Personnel Appropriation (MPA) days to keep the force operational throughout the year.
- The Air Force relies on the Guard and Reserve to meet operational requirements. Last year, there were over 55K manpower requests. Of the roughly 55,784 requests, 89.5% were filled with volunteers; there was no need to mobilize them.
- Lt Gen Wyatt concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

0940 – 1000. Chairman Punaro introduced Major General Timothy Kadavy, Army National Guard.

- *“Major General Tim Kadavy is the Deputy Director of the Army National Guard. He formerly served as the Adjutant General of the State of Nebraska. Having served as the Deputy Director for a couple of years, his experience will no doubt be of great help to the Army National Guard's recently appointed Director, LTG Bill Ingram.”*
- MG Kadavy presented a single slide and explained each point very clearly.
- *“Recruiting and retention numbers continue to be strong which shows Americans still want to serve.”*
- The Army Guard needs to reform the Inactive National Guard (ING) and has a legislative proposal to do this. The Army Guard also needs to be able to move non-deployable people into the ING and be able to fill the vacated unit slot with a backfill. Finally, MG Kadavy feels that the Army Guard needs to structure the ING more like the Individual Ready Reserve (IRR).
- DoD and Army leadership needs to look at separation incentives for departing active component soldiers to fill needed skills and grades in the Guard and Reserve. Gen McKinley then added that DoD needs to at least remove the disincentives for active duty members shifting to our reserve components.
- DoD policy requiring 30-days notice prior to RC mobilization should be waived for immediate mission needs like humanitarian response.
- The Army Guard needs DoD approval for use of 502(f) authority to pre-position/prepare Guard units prior to a disaster. Relying on there being a training nexus is not good.
- MG Kadavy concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

1000 – 1025. Chairman Punaro introduced Major General Keith Thurgood, United States Army Reserve.

- *“MG Keith Thurgood is Deputy Commanding General for Support, U.S. Army Reserve Command. He is here representing the Chief of the Army Reserve, LTG Jack Stultz.”*
- MG Thurgood stated that the Reserve Components have policies in place that do not serve the American public and the Nation's needs.
- He believes that the nation needs a flexible, operational force, and that some in-depth strategic thought is needed in order to construct a framework of reserve capability for the future.
- Currently, the Army Reserve has approximately 205K soldiers with 16K of them deployed. Access to the reserve component via the ARFORGEN model is the direction leadership is moving in order to get the Army Reserve equipped and the manning strategy right. With the ARFORGEN model, the Army has access to 24K reserve soldiers annually for a 5 year cycle to respond to

- contingencies; a great deal of capability that is predictable and routine.
- The Army Reserve has a skill level/mix problem. The force is composed of a lot of inexperienced youth, but lacks those with expert skills and experience. Army Reserve leadership must have the capability to go back to the recruiting commands to get the right people.
- He asked the RFPB for help communicating to DoD leadership about the insufficiency of above the line manning in their units. Currently, only 13% of the above the line manning are full time support versus the 19% DOD wide.
- MG Thurgood also asked the RFPB to tackle the “continuum of service” issue and the reduction of duty statuses.
- MG Thurgood

1025 – 1045. Chairman Punaro introduced Lieutenant General Steven Hummer, United States Marine Corps.

- *“LtGen Steven Hummer is Commander of the Marine Forces Reserve and Marine Forces North. Prior to his current assignment, he served in the Office of the Undersecretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness.”*
- LtGen Hummer stated that the Marine Corps is going to shed 15K people. This news was also reported in “Early Bird.” The article talks to Reserve units, and the other brigades being lost, etc.
- The Marine Corps is taking a hard look at itself. This review looks at core roles and functions.
- The Commandant of the Marine Corps feels confident that their mission can be accomplished with the adjusted end strength levels. Reserve end strength will be reduced to 39,600 personnel. Over 60K Marines have deployed during the past decade. 21,316K reservists deployed at the height of operations. LtGen Hummer stated that the Marine Reserves have averaged 6K mobilized members a year over the last 10 years.
- LtGen Hummer believes that the Marines already have an operational reserve. *“The real question is not whether we are an operational reserve; it is whether we can maintain what we have.”*
- Other than their two civil affairs groups, the Marine reserve is identical to their active duty counterparts. There is seamless integration when activated, and all reservists attend the same training, boot camp, schools, etc.
- LtGen Hummer felt that support of the proposed §12304(a) legislation for the activation of the reserve component is imperative if his Marines are to continue to be an operational reserve.
- LtGen Hummer concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

1045 – 1110. Chairman Punaro introduced Vice Admiral Dirk Debbink, United States Navy Reserve.

- *“VADM Dirk Debbink is Chief of the Navy Reserve and Commander, Navy Reserve Forces. Prior to serving on active duty, he was chairman of a design/build general contracting company.”*
- The Navy Reserve currently has 64,570 sailors with primarily a strategic mission. Operational opportunities exist for approximately 1/3 of all Navy Reservists. 2-3K are operational during any one year if taking into account the 5 year dwell time.
- VADM Debbink stated that the Navy Reserve vision is, *“we are the force provider of choice. The provider of valued capabilities to the nation, today and in the future.”*
- Continuum of Service is difficult for the Navy because all their billets are filled. They have plenty of Individual Ready Reserve sailors.
- VADM Debbink also felt that there is one Navy. The Navy Reserve is a mirror of the active Navy.
- He asked for RFPB help in the following areas: access to services and support for reserve families; continuum of care to provide Tricare for IRR members; and establishment of a career summary (i.e. DD-214) to document military participation for reservists.
- VADM Debbink concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

1110 – 1135. Chairman Punaro introduced Lieutenant General Charles Stenner, United States Air Force Reserve.

- *“Lt Gen Charles Stenner is Chief of the Air Force Reserve and Commander of the Air Force Reserve Command. He is a fighter pilot and previously served as the Air Force Assistant Deputy Chief of Staff for Strategic Plans and Programs.”*
- Lt Gen Stenner stated that the Air Force Reserve works well with both their active duty and Guard partners. In fact, AF Reserve has an Air Guard advisor on the staff to collaborate on Air Force issues affecting both components.
- AF Reserve members provide strategic depth and specialized skills. The Air Force Reserve Personnel Center manages approximately 1 million personnel records, which include retired active duty, Guard, and reservists.
- He further stated that continuum of service and transition from one component to another should be seamless. Additionally, a review is needed on the roles and missions filled by reservists – manpower from missions that wind down will be reapportioned to newer missions (i.e. cyber, intelligence collection, etc.).
- Employer Support of the Guard and Reserves (ESGR) and the Yellow Ribbon program must be emphasized and properly funded to ensure continued support and service to our local communities and reservists.
- Lt Gen Stenner echoed LtGen Hummer’s comments about having the proper authorities in place to access reservists, but also emphasized the importance of a funding stream (i.e. satisfactory levels of MPA days available to pay reservists) to pay for the Operational Reserve force. Contingencies without funding streams are an issue.
- Lt Gen Stenner concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

1135 – 1200. Chairman Punaro introduced Rear Admiral Steven Day (substitute for Rear Admiral David Callahan due to illness), United States Coast Guard Reserve.

- *“RDML David Callahan is Director of Reserve and Leadership for the US Coast Guard. He is an aviator and served as Coast Guard liaison to NATO during the Bosnia conflict. Rear Admiral Steven Day will fill in for RDML Callahan and give us an update on the Coast Guard Reserve.”*
- RDML Day stated that the Director of the Coast Guard Reserves is an active duty member, so the challenge every few years is to educate that person on the use of Reserve forces.
- The Coast Guard Reserve force has not grown since 1995. Today, the active and reserve components are not separate entities; they work together...especially on operational missions!
- The Coast Guard Reserve provided 60% of the response to the Deepwater Horizon oil spill.
- RDML Day expressed concern that Title 14 activations do not count towards early retirement. This is an area he would like some help from the Board in addressing.
- RDML Day related that the Tricare Reserve Select medical insurance is a huge benefit to reservists. He encourages his members to compare their employer’s medical insurance with Tricare Reserve Select to decide what is best for their situation. The dental plan and educational benefits are also a plus as well.
- RDML Day concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

1200 – 1300. Lunch was served and Chairman Punaro introduced General Craig McKinley, Chief, National Guard Bureau.

- *“General Craig R. McKinley is the Chief of the National Guard Bureau. He is the first 4-star Chief of the National Guard Bureau. Prior to this assignment he served as Director of the Air National Guard. By law, the NGB is a joint activity of the Department of Defense and is the channel of communications between the States, and the Army and Air Force on all matters pertaining to the National Guard. There is pending legislation that would grant the Chief of the National Guard Bureau a full seat on the Joint Chiefs of Staff.”*
- General McKinley stated that the Reserve Chiefs are a close group that comes together regularly to discuss reserve component issues. He applauded the Chairman and the Board for addressing six main issues which are of paramount importance to all our reserve components.

- Proper professional development is needed to build future Reserve Chiefs (i.e. build our bench for the future). Gen McKinley wondered how to develop our future leaders. Is civilian occupational experience necessary or is military service the primary emphasis area. He asked the Board to take a hard look at this issue.
- He stressed the importance of continuing to build and preserve partnership capacity throughout each component. *“We don’t want to revert back to the ‘bad old days’ where the reserve components were kept on a shelf and not used efficiently or in an integrated manner in time of war.”*
- Gen McKinley emphasized the need for an Emergency Response Fund for employing reserve organizations in domestic operations in the homeland.
- He mentioned to the Board that the Joint Chiefs and Service Chiefs all opposed allowing the National Guard Bureau Chief to be included as a member of the JCS. This position seemed to be a function of culture.
- Gen McKinley acknowledged that institutional bias towards the reserve components is still present among the Services and the Department; however, as we continue to struggle with it, we should be proud of how far we’ve come and where we are. It is important not to slip backwards.
- The budget battle is currently raging. Everyone is fighting for dollars when budgets are tight. It is possible that the reserve components may suffer, but all must work for that not to happen.
- There has been and will continue to be considerable turnover in the active force and in DoD. We cannot assume our bosses are aware of what we can do and who we are. Continue to educate!
- Gen McKinnley finished his remarks by stating that the Secretary of Defense has a daunting task with many tough choices to be made with impending budget cuts. The Reserve Forces Policy Board must give the SECDEF objective and analytical ideas that maximizes the use of our reserve forces and saves American taxpayer dollars.
- Gen McKinley concluded his remarks and asked if Board members had any questions.

### **BOARD REVIEW OF INFORMATION & FORMULATION OF SUBCOMMITTEE WORK PLANS**

1300 –1445. Board members broke out into their subcommittees to meet with their committee chairs and formulate their charter and work plans.

### **SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS**

1445 – 1515. Subcommittee Chair reports.

- ***Insuring a ready, capable, available and sustainable operational reserve - VADM John Cotton, USNR (Ret)***
  - VADM Cotton’s group is going to tackle the question of what is an Operational Reserve. How do you define it?
  - Group would like to extend an invitation to the active component Service Chiefs to discuss the “Operational Reserve” question.
  - Group supports pending legislation U.S.C. § 12304 and will propose additional needed law and doctrinal changes to ensure efficient and effective operational reserve force.
  - Group will study and pursue an initiative to implement one efficient medical and family readiness system.
- ***Enhancing DoD’s role in the Homeland – MG Marty Umbarger, ARNG***
  - MG Umbarger’s group wants to pursue the creation of a DoD wide emergency response fund to reimburse the reserve components for emergency response missions.
  - Group will study the Department of Defense’s Comprehensive Review portion on Homeland Defense to see if improvements can be made.
  - Recommended that the “Continuum of Service’ subcommittee look at the 30 day notice for recall issue mentioned by MG Kadavy.
  - Group would like to hear from members of the Joint Staff (J3, J5 & J8) on Homeland mission.

- Group will meet on March 6, 2011, prior to the next quarterly meeting.
- ***Creating a Continuum of Service – Maj Gen Anita Gallentine, USAFR***
  - Maj Gen Gallentine's group proposed recommending that the Secretary of Defense incentivize departing active component service members to transition to the reserve component in order to preserve the investment in experience and capability. This is a time sensitive issue that can be forwarded to him immediately.
  - Group will examine the Canadian military model of pathways of service to see what can be gleaned for our review of the continuum of service. What can we learn? Can we use it?
  - Group will request that the Quadrennial Review of Military Compensation staff report their findings and recommendations to the Reserve Forces Policy Board.
  - Group will pursue continuum of service for amputees and severely disabled members. The SECDEF should receive a report of what opportunities are available for disabled service members and whether they are being retained.
  - Group will review the Joint Qualification system and recommend changes to make it more reserve friendly.
- ***Supporting service members, families, and employees – Ms. Paulette Mason***
  - Ms. Mason's group will examine existing DoD instructions to determine problem areas for supporting reserve/guard service members and their families? A report on their findings will be provided at the March 7, 2012 meeting.
  - Group will work with OSD/RA, Mr. Young, to identify problem areas with the Yellow Ribbon program. To ensure the success of an operational force, we must ensure our family programs are supported with funding and manpower. Measures of effectiveness are needed to properly track this program and to see if improvements are needed.
  - Group will work with the ESGR to explore whether DoD policy and/or legislative changes are needed to help businesses. Need to educate employers on the benefits associated with having reservists in their organizations. Health insurance (Tricare) and leadership experience should be included as part of a marketing campaign.

#### **CLOSING REMARKS**

1515 – 1530. Chairman Punaro closed the meeting with a summary of the work ahead and guidance to the Reserve Forces Policy Board staff.

- *Next meeting is March 7, 2012*



**Arnold L. Punaro**  
**MajGen, USMCR (Ret)**  
**Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board**